



**INTER-AGENCY TASK FORCE ON THE HARMONIZATION OF
NATIONAL GOVERNMENT PERFORMANCE MONITORING, INFORMATION AND REPORTING SYSTEMS**
(Administrative Order No. 25 S. 2011)

May 31, 2023

JOSELITO F. VILLARUZ

President

West Visayas State University

Luna St. La Paz, Iloilo City

Attention: **Mr. Wilhelm P. Cerbo**
Focal Person

Dear President Villaruz:

This has reference to the request for reconsideration of the **West Visayas State University (WVSU)** dated April 20, 2023, relative to its rating on the **Process Results** and **Citizen/Client Satisfaction Results** criteria for the grant of the FY 2021 Performance Based-Bonus (PBB).

The assessment of concerned oversight agencies on the additional justifications/supporting documents submitted by the WVSU is as follows:

1. On obtaining a score of 3 due to the coverage of ISO QMS certification of only 2 out of 4 Major Final Outputs (MFOs).

The WVSU explained that although the audit scope of the university under ISO 9001: 2015 is Provision of Higher and Advanced Education Programs, it does however cover all of the core, management, and support processes including instruction, governance, research, and extension services. The WVSU provided additional documents to support this claim:

- WVSU's Quality Manual page 24 of 49 specifies the agency's Process and Scope of QMS Certification in the core processes, management processes, and support processes. Research and Extension Development is under the management processes.
- The Quality Management Structure as provided on page 27 of 49 of the WVSU Quality Manual reflects the involvement of the offices of research and extension in the implementation of the university's quality management system.
- The Quality Policy of the university reiterates that instruction, research, and extension are covered in meeting the quality educational needs and expectations of its stakeholders.



**Development Academy
of the Philippines**

Technical Secretariat and Resource Institution

- The Audit Plan of Socotec Certification International during the conduct of the 2nd Surveillance Audit last October 6-8, 2021 shows that the Office of Research Extension and Training was audited by Dr. Mark Vera during the third day of the scheduled audit.
- The Audit Report of the 2nd Surveillance Audit by Socotec Certification International pages 26 and 27 includes the external auditors' findings during the conduct of the audit in the research and extension offices.
- The 2021 Annual Audit Plan, Audit Plan/Schedule, Audit Details, and sample Internal Quality Audit Reports show that in the conduct of the Internal Quality Audit of the university, all of the units in the core processes, management processes, and support processes are covered in the conduct of the audit to include the research and extension offices. The University Research and Development Center (Research Office) was audited by Quicoy, Antonillas, and Vargas on July 16, 2021, while the University Extension and Development Center (UEDC) was audited by Cabalfin and Baluran on the same date.

Based on the report of the CHED-Office of the Institutional Quality Assurance and Governance (OIQAG) dated May 25, 2023, the WVSU's appeal had merit based on the justification and supporting documentation provided. As such, the CHED-OIQAG accepted that the WVSU obtained ISO Certification for all of its frontline services in FY 2021, covering the delivery of higher and advanced education as well as research and extension services.

Hence, based on the FY 2021 PBB criteria in Section 2.2 of the AO25 IATF MC 2021-2, the WVSU will now have a rating of 5 on the Process Results.

2. On the unresolved complaint received through the Hotline #8888 platform, which resulted in a rating of 3 for the Citizen/Client Satisfaction Results criteria.

Based on the assessment, the WVSU was only able to resolve 4 out of 6 (67% resolution rate) complaints received through the #8888 platform for the period of January 1, 2021 to December 31, 2021 based on the Office of the President (OP) report dated December 21, 2022.

The WVSU explained that the agency has exerted efforts to religiously comply with the reglementary period to answer with concrete and specific action on the complaints raised. The WVSU also provided copies of the communication showing the responses to corresponding ticket references for the six (6) complaints received.

Based on the Office of the President #8888 Citizens' Complaint Center (OP-CCC) report dated April 28, 2023, it was found that the #8888 OP-CCC recorded six (6) concerns for WVSU for January 2021 to December 2021 per system-generated data, two (2) of which were tagged as unresolved. The unacted concerns with reference numbers P20210907-269-2 and P20210914-108-43 were referred to the #8888 portal of the Commission on Higher Education and was subsequently referred by the CHED focal team to CHED Regional Office (RO) VI Western Visayas. However, it transpires that CHED RO VI did not endorse the subject concern to WVSU and that it has remained open in the #8888 portal until the generation of reports submitted to the AO25 TWG. The appeal of WVSU for reconsideration is granted.

With this, the WVSU will now achieve a **100% (4 out of 4)** resolution rate of the complaints received through the #8888 platform from January 1, 2021 to December 31, 2021.

In view of the foregoing, the WVSU will now have a rating of **5** on the Citizen/Client Satisfaction Results, based on the FY 2021 PBB criteria in Section 2.4 of the AO25 IATF MC 2021-2,

Further, the WVSU has now obtained **90 points** for the PBB Criteria and Conditions as provided in Section 4.0 of the AO25 IATF MC 2021-1 due to the change in its rating on the **Process Results** and **Citizen/Client Satisfaction Results criteria**. Thus, the WVSU is **eligible** for the grant of the FY 2021 PBB.

Attached is the revised Final Eligibility Assessment and Scorecard of the WVSU.

Thank you very much.

Sincerely yours,



ACHILLES GERARD C. BRAVO
Assistant Secretary, DBM and
Chair, IATF TWG

REVISED FINAL ELIGIBILITY ASSESSMENT FOR FY 2021 PERFORMANCE-BASED BONUS

WEST VISAYAS STATE UNIVERSITY

Overall Assessment: The West Visayas State University (WVSU) achieved **90 points** and is **eligible** for the grant of FY 2021 PBB.

A. Physical Accomplishments			
Criteria	Score	Points	Remarks
<p>1. Performance Results</p> <p>Achieved 88.89% (16 out of 18) of the Congress-approved performance targets for FY 2021; failure to meet the targets for 2 indicators are due to uncontrollable factors.</p>	4	20	<p>The WVSU did not meet two (2) performance indicators.</p> <p>1. MFO2:Advanced Education Program PI3:Percentage of accredited graduate programs. The actual accomplishment was 90% of the targeted 93.33% (or 96% rate of accomplishment).</p> <p>2. MFO5:Hospital Services Program PI3:Bed occupancy rate. The actual accomplishment was 44.81% of the targeted 86% (or 52.10% rate of accomplishment).</p> <p>The Commission on Higher Education (CHED) considered the non-attainment of the targets to be due to uncontrollable factors based on the CHED report dated June 10, 2022.</p>
<p>2. Process Results</p> <p>Achieved ISO certification or its equivalent certification for all frontline services.</p>	5	25	<p>The WVSU provided an ISO 9001:2015 certification for the provision of higher education programs and advanced studies, certified by the SOCOTEC Certification Philippines, Inc., valid until September 06, 2024.</p> <p>The SUC's ISO QMS certification covers 4 out of 4 Major Final Outputs (MFOs) - higher education, advanced education, research, and extension programs based on the revalidation report received from CHED dated May 25, 2023.</p>
<p>3. Financial Results</p> <p>Achieved an average of 67.78% Disbursements and Earmarked Income BUR.</p>	4	20	<p>The actual accomplishment of the WVSU for Disbursements and Earmarked Income Budget Utilization Rate (BUR) was 67.78% based on the Department of Budget and Management - Region 6 report dated April 27, 2022.</p>

A. Physical Accomplishments			
Criteria	Score	Points	Remarks
4. Citizen/Client Satisfaction Results Achieved a 4.73 overall satisfaction rating, with 100% resolution of #8888 complaints and did not receive complaints from the CCB platform.	5	25	The WVSU resolved all complaints (4 out of 4) received through the #8888 platform for the period of January 1, 2021 to December 31, 2021 based on the Office of the President (OP) revalidation report dated April 28, 2023. The agency did not receive any complaints through the Contact Center ng Bayan (CCB) platform for the period of January 1, 2021 to December 31, 2021 based on the Civil Service Commission (CSC) report dated February 24, 2022. In addition, the WVSU reported an overall satisfaction rating of 4.73 and observed the procedures for conducting the Citizen/Client Satisfaction Survey (CCSS) pursuant to Annex 4 of the AO 25 MC 2021-1.
Total	18	90	

B. Agency Accountabilities	Compliance Status
• Transparency Seal	Compliant
• Freedom of Information	Compliant
• Updating of Citizen's Charter	Compliant
• Compliance to Audit Findings	Compliant
• Posting of Agency Review and Compliance Procedure (ARCP) of SALN	Compliant
• PhilGEPS Posting	Compliant
• Submission of FY 2022 Annual Procurement Plan-Common Use Supplies and Equipment (APP-CSE)	Compliant
• Submission of FY 2021 Non-Common Use Supplies and Equipment (APP non-CSE)	Compliant
• Posting of Indicative FY 2022 APP non-CSE	Compliant
• Submission of FY 2020 Agency Procurement Compliance and Performance Indicators (APCPI)	Compliant
• Undertaking of Early Procurement Activities (EPA) covering FY 2022 Procurement Projects	Compliant

C. Eligibility of Delivery Units and Individuals/Rates

To be eligible for the FY 2021 PBB, the agency must attain a total score of at least 70 points. To be able to attain at least 70 points, the agency should achieve a performance rating of 4 in at least three (3) criteria. In such a case, while the agency will be eligible, the unit/s most responsible (including its head) for the criteria stated in Section 3.0 of MC 2021-1 with a performance rating of below 4 will be isolated from the grant of the FY 2021 PBB.

The unit/s most responsible (including its head) for the non-compliance with the Agency Accountabilities provided in Section 5.0 of MC 2021-1 will also be isolated from the grant of the FY 2021 PBB.

To be eligible for FY 2021 PBB, employees belonging to the First, Second, and Third Levels should receive a rating of at least "Very Satisfactory" based on the agency's CSC-approved Strategic Performance Management System (SPMS) or the requirement prescribed by the CESB.

For additional information, please refer to Section 6.0 (Eligibility of Delivery Units and Individuals) and Section 7.0 (Rates of the PBB) of MC 2021-01.